
A Comparative Study of Job Commitment of Bps and Tts Teachers in Universities of Malakand Division

Rafiq Ahmad¹, Dr.Asghar Ali², Kashif Suhan³

¹ PhD Scholar, Malakad. Email: University.rafiqahmad346@gmail.com

² Associate professor. Email: Asghar5290100@yahoo.com

³ MPhil scholar

Corresponding Author: D.Asghar Ali Email: Asghar5290100@yahoo.com

DOI: <https://doi.org/10.70670/sra.v3i4.1291>

Abstract

The aim of this research was to find out “Job commitment of BPS and TTS teachers in universities of Malakand division”. The main objectives of the research study were to explore the job commitment of both the BPS and TTS teachers, to compare the job commitment of both the BPS and TTS teachers, This research was delimited to the public sector universities of Malakand division. The research design of the study was survey and causal comparative, as data were collected from both BPS and TTS university teachers through Job Commitment Scale (JCS) and comparison was done because job commitment had two grouping variables BPS and TTS. there were 71 statements and the minimum score was 1 for strongly disagree (SDA) statement while maximum value was 5 for strongly agree (SA) as it was constructed, therefore the maximum and minimum values for all statement were added and were divided by two (2) which was 213 (median of the scale). The population of the study were 257 university teachers, including Assistant Professors, Associate Professors, and Professors from public sector universities in the Malakand Division. The sample size was 155 teachers and 124 questionnaires were returned because of the busy schedule of the teacher’s .Response rate was 80 %. After validation the final scale was composed of 71 items. For reliability purpose Cronbach’s Alpha was found 0.85 which was acceptable. The data was analyzed by descriptive as well as inferential statistics through SPSS. The main results of the study were; the level of job commitment of both BPS and TTS university teachers on (JCS) was high, comparatively the job commitment of BPS university teachers was higher than TTS university teachers The main recommendation of the study was, Universities of Pakistan should take the recruitment of all teachers on BPS basis, and should give job security to TTS teachers.

Key Words: TTS and BPS Teachers, Comparison, Job commitment

Introduction

Education serves as the fundamental support system for the societal, political, economic, and cultural aspects of a nation or state. Education is a multidimensional procedure that equally influences every aspect of human life. The primary role of educational institutions is to prepare and instruct individuals in physical, mental, spiritual, psychological, and social aspects (Momot, 2021). According to (Crossman, & Harris 2006) job commitment is exceedingly important for individuals and organizations. For most people, their job is one of their main sources of income, and their level of commitment to it directly affects how productive and efficient their work is. One way to define

organizational commitment is through long-term goal achievement and staff discipline (Kurniasari et al., 2018; Rahmatullah et al., 2022).

Higher level faculty members can choose between the Tenure Track System (TTS) and the Basic Pay Scale (BPS) as their service structure. Both of these service structures are designed for the stability and better service delivery of faculty members; however, both these systems operate in different ways and each one has certain advantages and drawbacks (Gul, et al., 2023).

Levin and Shaker, (2011) conducted a study that the Basic Pay System (BPS) is heavily dependent on teaching job and responsibilities.

It deeply deals with a meagre respect and limited perks and privileges in the official work. On the contrary, Tenure Track System is deeply concerned about teaching, effective service and research productivity. While Basic Pay System teachers are solely concerned about teaching while they have , low salaries and compensation, and have far little reverence if compared with Tenure Track System (TTS) teachers (Kezar, & Sam, 2010).

Educational institutes and organizations depend directly on the motivation and commitment of faculty members and ensuring quality education in higher education institutions (HEIs) is a difficult challenge for education managers (Bibi et al., 2024).

Statement of the Problem

Institutions of higher learning are essential to a country's future development. Faculty members' commitment to their jobs is essential for both people and organizations. Productivity and efficiency depend heavily on how committed and attached faculty members are to their positions and organizations. Pakistani universities employ two methods for appointing faculty members: the Tenure Track System (TTS) and the Basic Pay Scale (BPS).

Although each system has its own design, advantages, and disadvantages, little is known about how each affects university Teachers' Commitment to their jobs. Numerous studies on the morale, job commitment, and job satisfaction of intermediate and university level teachers have been carried out in Pakistan and around the world (Rauf, 2012); Research of Ahmad, (2024) is on Comparison of job commitment of BPS and TTS University Teachers at the Universities of Malakand Division, this variable has not been studied in Rauf (2012). So not only the nature of study is different in this research but also the population and variables are different. However, the employment Commitment of university instructors at BPS and TTS has not been examined in these studies. The purpose of this study is to make clear the differences in the level of job commitment and compare it between BPS and TTS Teachers in the universities located in the Malakand division.

Objectives

The objectives of the study are:

1. To find out the job commitment of both the BPS and TTS teachers.
2. To compare the job commitment of both the BPS and TTS teachers.

Hypotheses

The hypothesis of the study were:

H 1; The level of job commitment of BPS and TTS university teachers is higher on Job Commitment scale (JCS).

Ho 2; There is no mean significant difference between the job commitment of BPS and TTS university teachers on Job Commitment scale (JCS).

Significance of the Study

The comparative study of job commitment between BPS and TTS faculty members in universities of KPK is of crucial significance for multiple reasons. Faculty members play a crucial role in molding the academic and research landscape of a nation. However, there are two systems of faculty employment at university level in KPK. The findings of the study will significantly influence the

higher education formulation and decision-making processes. The recommendations of the study help all the stake holders, the policymakers, university administrators and education managers to formulate policies in the best interests of the university teachers and students. Furthermore, this study was more productive for educators and analysts in the field of higher education.

This study explained that which service structure maximizes the job commitment of university teachers.

The research clarified that job commitment of BPS University teachers were comparatively high than TTS teachers so all the stake holders should recruit all university teachers on BPS basis so that the teachers may have high job commitment.

Delimitation of the Study

The study was delimited to four public sector universities of Malakand division, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa (KPK). The data for the study were obtained only through questionnaire. The data was delimited to job commitment among university teachers including assistant professors, associate professors, and professors working under TTS and BPS at public sector universities of Malakand division, KPK.

Research Methodology

The methodology and processes used to carry out this investigation are described in this section.

Design of the Study

The researcher investigated and compared the job commitment of BPS and TTS university teachers. Survey research design and causal comparative designs were used as data were collected from both BPS and TTS university teachers through Job Commitment Scale (JCS) and comparison was done because job commitment had two grouping variables BPS and TTS.

Population of the Study

Two hundred fifty-seven university teachers, including assistant professors, associate professors, and professors from public universities in the Malakand Division, made the study's population.

Sample

The population table by Krejcie & Morgan, (1970) states that if there are 260 subjects in the population, the sample size should be 155. Only 124 teachers returned the questionnaires out of 155 samples. The teacher's main excuse for not filling out the questionnaires was that they were too busy. The response rate was 80% which was acceptable for survey. Simple random sampling was employed in this investigation.

Table 1: Sample of the Study

Sample	
TTS	BPS
52	72
Total = 124	

Instrumentation and scale development process

After a thorough review of related literature, previous scales and consultations with various university teachers (BPS and TTS), the Job Commitment scale (JCS) was developed.

Validity of the Scale: There are two methods of scale validation that are qualitatively and quantitatively. In qualitative validation the instrument is validated by subject matter experts, while in

quantitative validation the scale is validated by factor analysis. For factor analysis large sample was required which was very difficult for the researcher to collect due to shortage of time and resources as there were 101 statements initially and according to the need of factor analysis it needed at least 500 sample from other universities which was almost impossible for the researcher due to resources, time and busy schedules of university teachers. Therefore, no factor was made in the scale. Therefore the scale was only validated qualitatively by two subject matter experts.

Initially the scale was composed of 101 items, it was validated by two subject matter experts. After validation they suggested that many of the items were irrelevant and some were ambiguous therefore there suggestions were incorporated in the scale and the final scale was composed of 71 items.

To make the scale more valid and understandable the items were translated into Urdu language by two experts, one was Master of Arts (M.A) English and one was Master of Arts (M.A) Urdu/

Job commitment scale (JCS) was developed to measure the job commitment of university teachers. It was a five-point Likert scale having options (strongly disagree SDA, disagree DA, undecided UD, Agree, AG, Strongly Agree SA). A value of 5 was assign to strongly agree, 4 was to Agree, 3 was to undecided, 2 was to disagree, 1 was to strongly disagree. The negative statements were eleven (11) the values of which were recoded in analysis.

Pilot testing and Reliability: A pilot study was conducted on a sample of thirty-five Teachers of University of Peshawar (BPS and TTS) In pilot testing, no ambiguity was found in the scale. For reliability purpose Cronbach's alpha was found; by using SPSS (statistical package for social sciences) and the value of Cronbach's alpha was 0.85 which was acceptable.

Data Collection

The questionnaires were administered to 155 BPS and TTS teachers in order to collect data by simple random sampling. Only 124 Teachers returned the questionnaires out of 155 samples.

Ethical Consideration

Before distributing the questionnaire, the respondents' consent was obtained as part of the research's ethical considerations. When the researcher visited all four universities and subjects, the researcher requested the teachers to complete the questionnaire. They were informed of the study's objectives and given the assurance that no other party would obtain the data they provided without their consent. Some of the subjects filled the questionnaires on the spot while some said to fill it when they found time. However 31 subjects excused to find no time for filling the questionnaire and returned to the researcher.

Data Analysis

Both descriptive and inferential statistics were applied to the data analysis process

Data Analysis

The criteria for labelling the level of job commitment on both BPS and TTS university teachers was taken as median of the scale. The minimum value of the scale was 71 while the maximum value was 355 and its median was 213. Two hundred and thirteen was taken as cut point for labelling high job commitment, low job commitment and moderate job commitment. The score above 213 was taken as high job commitment while the score taken below 213 was taken as low job commitment while the score 213 was taken as moderate job commitment.

Table 2: Level of Job Commitment of BPS and TTS University Teachers

H 1: The level of job commitment of BPS and TTS university teachers is higher on (JCS).

Level of job commitment	Frequency
High job commitment	124

Moderate job commitment	0
Low job commitment	0

Table 2 Shows that the level of job commitment of both BPS and TTS university teachers on (JCS) was high. The frequency of high job commitment was (124). No moderate job commitment and low job commitment were found. So the directional hypothesis was accepted. The reason may be university job is a prestigious job and in Pakistan most teachers want to acquire this position.

Table 3: Comparison of Mean Difference of Job Commitment of BPS and TTS University Teachers

Ho 2: There is no mean significant difference between the job commitment of BPS and TTS university teachers on (JCS).

Nature of the job	<i>N</i>	<i>Mean</i>	<i>df</i>	<i>T</i>	<i>SD</i>	<i>Sig</i>
TTS	52	2.98	122	-3.405	14.11	0.001
BPS	72	3.08			16.03	
Total	124					

$P < 0.05$

Table 4.10 show that level of significance (0.001) is lower than 0.05 so the null hypothesis with BPS mean (3.08) TTS (2.08) $df = 122$, $t = -3.405$ was rejected, and there is mean significant difference between job commitment level of BPS and TTS university teachers on JCS, so null hypothesis was rejected. Therefore, it clarifies that job commitment of BPS university teachers was higher than TTS university teachers. BPS university teachers had more attachment, dedication and loyalty with universities and their jobs than TTS teachers.

Findings

1. The level of job commitment of both BPS and TTS University teachers on (JCS) was high. The frequency of high job commitment was 124 (100%). No moderate job commitment and low job commitment were found (0%).
2. Level of significance was lower than 0.05 so the null hypothesis with BPS mean (3.08) TTS (2.08) $df = 122$, $t = -3.405$ was rejected, and there was mean significant difference between job commitment level of BPS and TTS university teachers. It clarifies that job commitment of BPS university teachers was higher than TTS university teachers.

Conclusions

The main conclusions of the study were

1. The level of job commitment of both BPS and TTS university teachers was high. There was no teacher whose job commitment level was low or moderate. The reason may be university teachers' job whether it is BPS or TTS is considered as very prestigious job and no body want to quit the job.
2. Comparatively the job commitment of BPS teachers were high than the job commitment of TTS teachers.

Discussions

Employees to stay in institutions and enhance the high-quality services they offer, job commitment is important because institutions need highly committed employees (Putri et al., 2023). Another study (Scott & Taylor, 1985) also claims job commitment of BPS (Basic Pay Scale) and TTS (Tenure Track System) teachers have different roles and job expectations and therefore has different job commitment. The first objective of the study was to explore the job commitment level of both the BPS and TTS faculty members. This study was conducted on comparing job commitment between these two

streams in universities of Malakand division, KP. This study revealed that the job commitment level of both BPS and TTS university teachers in the universities of Malakand Division KP was higher. When employees are satisfied, they tend to exhibit greater productivity, dedication, and the delivery of superior results for the institution (Soehaditama et al., 2024). The reason may be University job whether it is BPS or TTS teachers is prestigious job and nobody wants to leave this job. The second objective was to compare job commitment of BPS and TTS university faculty at Malakand Division. The findings showed that the job commitment of BPS university teachers was comparatively higher than TTS University teachers which confirms the results of Siagian et al. (2023), internal motivation can improve employee engagement, which in turn improves performance. For example, a teacher that is intrinsically driven to teach well will try to come up with creative teaching strategies. While TTS faculty is extrinsically motivated by incentives. This may be the reason why TTS faculty show less job commitment than BPS faculty. This study is also in accordance with the study that. Employee commitment is also impacted by work stress. Workers feel content and loyal to the institution when they are happy with their work-related stress, work environment, pay, or rules (Gazi et al., 2024) as TTS faculty demand more work and research as their job demand, thus facing more stress. This study is also in accordance with the studies of (Uddin, 2021; Thompson 2012) who assert BPS teachers, work on standardized pay scale and getting annual increment, represent commitment due to constancy in these two variables. While, TTS teachers, would have to show performance especially in research, may prove commitment by self-sufficiency, credit, and research achievement which confirms that TTS teachers face more stress which ultimately affect their job commitment negatively. Similarly this result is also confirmed by the study of (Sharma & Jyoti 2020) who claim job commitment as having dual functions: it serves as a means of income and as a significant aspect of one's life. A person's job not only occupies a central role in their daily life but also serves as a marker of social status within society. Job commitment is strongly correlated with length of service. As there is less security to TTS faculty in terms of length of service therefore, the job commitment of BPS is higher than TTS faculty.

The findings of this study contradict with other studies like Swailes, and Biggs (2006) clarify relationships, dedication, and contentment between permanent and contract based employees. For instance, younger teachers in Tenure Track system (TTS) roles may exhibit different levels of commitment compared to their tenured counterparts in Basic Pay Scale (BPS). In contrast, TTS teachers, typically on performance-based contracts with higher mobility and research expectations, may prioritize autonomy, academic freedom, and recognition in their commitment to their roles. It is important for university teachers who shows commitment influenced their quality of teaching and job devotion. So, Job commitment not only represent enthusiasm to tasks but also emotive venture in the organization. Beri, (2016) also claim that older teachers who have more experience show more job commitment than less experienced TTS teachers.

Recommendations

1. Universities may implement only one system Basic pay scale (BPS) because BPS Universities teachers had comparatively high job committed than TTS teachers.
2. Universities may give same values to teaching and research because BPS teachers were more focused to teaching while TTS teachers were more focused to research.
3. Universities should provide incentives, benefits and job security to both cadre BPS and TTS so that both got high job commitment equally.
4. More research is needed on job commitment in other provinces of Pakistan having more sample and population.

References

- Crossman, A., & Harris, P. (2006). Job satisfaction of secondary school teachers. *Educational Management Administration & Leadership*, 34(1), 29-46.
<https://doi.org/10.1177/1741143206059538>

- Momot, O. L. E. N. A., Grynova, M., Mamon, O., Sribna, Y., Diachenko-Bohun, M., Hrytsai, N., ...& Zukow, W. A. L. E. R. Y. (2021). Composition of personality education of future teachers during the creation of health environment at higher education institution. DOI:10.7752/jpes.2021.s5373
- Kurniasari, I. C., Thoyib, A., & Rofiaty, R. (2018). Peran Komitmen Organisasional Dalam Memediasi Pengaruh Kompetensi, Pelatihan Dan Budaya Organisasi Terhadap Kinerja Perawat. *Mix: Jurnal Ilmiah Manajemen*, 8(2), 352. <https://doi.org/10.22441/mix.2018.v8i2.010>
- Rahmatullah, A., David Ramdansyah, A., Kambara, R., & Haryadi, D. (2022). Improving Organizational Performance with Organizational Culture and Transformational Leadership through Intervening Organizational Commitment Variables. *Dinasti International Journal of Digital Business Management*, 3(2), 180–194. <https://doi.org/10.31933/dijdbm.v3i2.1118>. <https://doi.org/10.31933/dijdbm.v3i2.11187>
- Gul, R., Tahir, T., & Ishfaq, U. (2023). Perspectives of the teachers on challenges and possibilities to online system of education amid COVID-19 outbreak in Balochistan, Pakistan. *SageOpen*, 13(1), <https://doi.org/10.1177/21582440231063>
- Kezar, A., & Sam, C. (2010). Understanding the new majority of non-tenure-track faculty in higher education--Demographics, experiences, and plans of action. *ASHE higher education report*, 36(4), 1-133. <https://eric.ed.gov/?id=EJ907425>
- Levin, J. S., & Shaker, G. G. (2011). The hybrid and dualistic identity of full-time non-tenure-track faculty. *American Behavioral Scientist*, 55(11), 1461–1484. <https://doi.org/10.1177/0002764211409382>
- Bibi, I., Tufail, A., & Shah, H. A. (2024). Impact of Knowledge Sharing on Employee Performance in Higher Education: Moderating Role of Employee Motivation and Employee Engagement. *Journal of Management and Research*, 11(2), 01-27. DOI: <https://doi.org/10.29145/jmr.112.01>
- Rauf, M. (2012). *Comparative Study of Organizational Commitment, Morale and Job Satisfaction of Subject Specialists and Lecturers Teaching at Intermediate Level* (Doctoral dissertation, university of the Punjab Lahore).
- Sattar, A., Nawaz, A., & Khan, S. (2012). The contextual impacts on job satisfaction of employees in the developing states like Pakistan. *Universal journal of education and general studies*, 1(5), 136-145. <https://www.universalresearchjournals.org/ujegs>
- Putri, M. P., Prahiawan, W., Ramdansyah, A. D., & Haryadi, D. (2023). Relevance of organizational commitment, as a mediator of its contribution to employee performance at the Merak-Banten marine transportation service company. *Enrichment: Journal of Management*, 12(6), 5213-5223. <https://doi.org/10.35335/enrichment.v12i6.1191>
- Soehaditama, J. P., Arini, D. U., & Suhendra, A. (2024). Determination Employee Performance and Job Satisfaction: Study Literature Review. *Greenation International Journal of Tourism and Management*, 2(3), 191-207. <https://research.e-greenation.org/GIJTM/index>
- Siagian, A. O., Widyastuti, T., Karsono, B., Susanto, P. C., Zulasaman, & Mussadiq, H. (2023). Pengaruh Kepemimpinan , Motivasi , Disiplin , dan Upah terhadap Kinerja Karyawan Bank BNI Syariah Indonesia. *Jurnal Jumbiwira*, 2(1), 112–132. <https://doi.org/10.56910/jumbiwira.v2i1.565>
- Gazi, M. A. I., Yusof, M. F., Islam, M. A., Amin, M. B., & bin S Senathirajah, A. R. (2024). Analyzing the impact of employee job satisfaction on their job behavior in the industrial setting: An analysis from the perspective of job performance. *Journal of Open Innovation: Technology, Market, and Complexity*, 10(4), 100427. DOI: [10.1016/j.joitmc.2024.100427](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.joitmc.2024.100427)
- Uddin, M. S. (2021). *Impact of training on employees' job satisfaction: a study on some selected cement factories in Bangladesh* (Doctoral dissertation, University of Dhaka). <http://repository.library.du.ac.bd:8080/xmlui/xmlui/handle/123456789/1685>
- Thompson, E. R., & Phua, F. T. (2012). A brief index of affective job satisfaction. *Group &*

- Organization Management*, 37(3), 275-307. <https://doi.org/10.1177/1059601111434201>
- Swales, S., and D. Biggs (2006). *Relationships, dedication, and contentment between permanent employees and agency labor*. 28(2), *Employee Relations*, 130–143. doi/10.1108/01425450610639365/full/html
- Beri, N. (2016). Job Satisfaction and Teaching Effectiveness of BTC and Special BTC Teachers in Uttar Pradesh. *The International Journal of Indian Psychology*, 3(2), 128-136. <http://www.ijip.in>